RESOLUTION NO. 2023-04

A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF SANTA ANA APPROVING THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 2140 NORTH ROSS STREET (HISTORIC EXTERIOR MODIFICATION APPLICATION NO. 2023-03)

BE IT RESOLVED BY THE HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF SANTA ANA AS FOLLOWS:

Section 1. The Historic Resources Commission of the City of Santa Ana hereby finds, determines and declares as follows:

- A. Andrew Spero and Amy Miller ("Applicants") are requesting approval of Historic Exterior Modification Application No. 2023-03 to allow exterior modifications to the property at 2140 North Ross Street, historically known as the Fuller-Utt House.
- B. The legal owners of the property are Andrew Michael Spero, an unmarried man and Amy Cathleen Miller, an unmarried woman, as join tenants.
- C. The legal description for the subject property is attached hereto as Exhibit A and incorporated by this reference as though fully set forth herein.
- D. The Fuller-Utt House is individually listed as No. 488 on the Santa Ana Register of Historical Properties and categorized as "Contributive" in 2007.
- E. The Fuller-Utt House was originally built in 1930 and is architecturally significant as an English Revival Style residence. Character-defining exterior features of the Fuller-Utt House that should be preserved include, but may not be limited to, materials and finishes (stucco, wood, and cast stone); roof configuration and detailing; original windows and doors where extant; chimney; architectural details such as the shingles with rolled edges and cast stone surrounds.
- F. Pursuant to Santa Ana Municipal Code Section 30-6, no exterior physical modifications, other than those identified by the Historic Resources Commission for administrative approval by city staff, shall be permitted with respect to a historic structure until the Historic Resources Commission approves such request at a duly noticed public hearing and issues a certificate of appropriateness. The Historic Resources Commission shall issue the certificate of appropriateness upon finding that the proposed modification(s) does not substantially change the character and integrity of the historic property.

- G. The proposed exterior modifications to the three-bedroom, single-story residence include the partial demolition of an existing bedroom at the building's northwest corner to accommodate a new rear addition, and an interior remodel consisting of removing an interior laundry room and expanding the existing kitchen by approximately 229 square feet, and a new interior master bathroom. The proposed building addition will accommodate a new master bedroom with walk-in-closet addition of approximately 261 square feet. The existing bedroom will be reconfigured into a new master bathroom of approximately 144 square feet, providing the residence with a second bathroom while maintaining the residence's three bedroom count.
- H. Pursuant to Santa Ana Municipal Code Section 30-6, the Historic Resources Commission held a duly noticed public hearing on May 3, 2023, for the request for exterior modifications to the Fuller-Utt House.
- I. Since the property is deemed a historic structure, all exterior modifications are required to meet the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - 1. The following Secretary of Interior's Standards are applicable:
 - i. The project complies with Standard No. 1. The property currently maintains its historic use as a single-family residence. The use is not proposed to change. The interior configuration will remain substantially the same with the addition providing enhanced functionality.
 - ii. The project complies with Standard No. 2. The historic character of the subject property will be retained and preserved. The proposed addition has been designed to remove as little historic material as possible and will be located on a secondary, rear façade, where it will not be generally visible from the public right-of-way. The proposed exterior alterations will not alter the primary east (front) elevation, or any important spatial relationships that characterize the property. The salvaged rear (west) elevation window to replace the existing south elevation window will maintain the property's historic window materials and will be located towards the west (rear) half of the south elevation, further away from the street.
 - iii. The project complies with Standard No. 3. The proposed changes will not create a false sense of historical development. The proposed addition will read as contemporary in comparison to the existing single-family residence, which incorporates distinctive architectural features of the English Revival style. The addition will have a front-gabled roof to match the existing house, which is designed to be compatible with the existing scale and massing of the residence yet distinct enough to discern that it

is a new addition. Moreover, the addition will be distinguished by the lack the rolled edges (thatching detail) at the gable's fascia, and the wider eaves which will have an additional 2x2 wood fascia trim board, as well as the double-hung windows without the upper sash horn detail. Therefore, the architectural treatment will read as contemporary, not conjectural.

- iv. The project complies with Standard No. 5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize the property will be preserved. The project does not propose to remove character-defining features or materials/finishes along the primary elevation. The project proposes to remove part of the rear (west) and side (north) elevations to accommodate a master bedroom addition, which includes salvaging an original window and relocating it at the south side elevation to accommodate the kitchen remodel; removing non-original French doors; and removing a door and window along the rear (west) elevation, all of which are not readily visible from the public right-of-way.
- The project complies with Standard No. 9. The new rear v. addition will not destroy historic materials, features, or spatial relationships that characterize the property. The proposed addition is located at the rear (northwest corner) in an area that is not easily visible from the public right-of-way. Important spatial relationships characterizing the English Revival architectural style will not be disturbed, as the addition is positioned to the rear of the existing house. Although a new, front-gable roof will be added to the existing rear hip roof, only a small portion of the existing roof will be altered to accommodate the addition; the new gable will not alter any of the existing roof located on the primary (east) facade or any of the north (side) elevation that is visible from the street. The materials of the new addition will also be compatible with the existing historic materials, through the use of similar materials, as well as differentiated by the lack the rolled edges (thatching detail) at the gable's fascia, the wider fascia trim, as well as the double-hung windows without the upper sash horn detail. The kitchen remodel will incorporate a salvaged original wood window, to be located from the rear (west) elevation in place of an existing window at the south (side) elevation, in order to create fenestration symmetry at the south elevation.

- vi. The project complies with Standard No. 10. The proposed project is considered generally reversible, as it does not remove essential aspects of the building's form and materials. The proposed addition will be located in the rear of the house, where it is not generally visible from the public right-of-way, and avoids the most significant and character-defining features. The essential form of the house and the vast majority of its historic materials will remain unimpaired.
- vii. Standards 4 and 6-8 are not applicable. No features of this description would be affected by this Project.

<u>Section 2</u>. In accordance with the California Environmental Quality Act, the recommended action is exempt from further review under Section 15331, Class 31, as this action is designed in a manner consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards. Categorical Exemption, Environmental Review No. 2023-41 will be filed for this project.

<u>Section 3</u>. The Historic Resources Commission of the City of Santa Ana after conducting the public hearing hereby approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for Historic Exterior Modification Application No. 2023-03, as conditioned in Exhibit B, attached hereto and incorporated herein. The Historic Resources Commission finds that the proposed modifications do not substantially change the character and integrity of the historic property. This decision is based upon the evidence submitted at the above said hearing, which includes, but is not limited to: the Staff Report and exhibits attached thereto and the public testimony, all of which are incorporated herein by this reference.

<u>Section 4</u>. The Historic Resources Commission Secretary is hereby directed to file a certified copy of this Resolution with the County Recorder's Office after the adoption of this Resolution pursuant to Public Resources Code Section 5029.

ADOPTED this 3rd day of May 2023.

Tim Rush Chairperson APPROVED AS TO FORM: Sonia R. Carvalho, City Attorney

By:_____

John M. Funk Chief Assistant City Attorney

AYES:	Commission members: Alberta Christy, Daniel Cornelius, Ginelle Hardy, Irma Jauregui, Mark McLoughlin, Tim Rush (6)
NOES:	Commission members
ABSTAIN:	Commission members

NOT PRESENT: Commission members: Keith Carpenter, Dwayne Shipp (2)

CERTIFICATE OF ATTESTATION AND ORIGINALITY

I, NUVIA OCAMPO, Commission Secretary, do hereby attest to and certify the attached Resolution No. 2023-04 to be the original resolution adopted by Historic Resources Commission of the City of Santa Ana on May 3, 2023.

Date: _____

Nuvia Ocampo Commission Secretary City of Santa Ana

EXHIBIT A LEGAL DESCRIPTION

APN	Address	Legal Description	Owner Names
002-112-12	2140 North Ross Street	THE LAND REFERRED TO HEREIN BELOW IS SITUATED IN THE COUNTY OF ORANGE, STATE OF CALIFORNIA AND IS DESCRIBED AS FOLLOWS: LOT 7 OF TRACT NO. 946, IN THE CITY OF SANTA ANA, COUNTY OF ORANGE, STATE OF CALIFORNIA, AS PER MAP RECORDED IN BOOK 30, PAGE 3 OF MISCELLANEOUS MAPS, IN THE OFFICE OF THE COUNTY RECORDER OF SAID COUNTY.	Andrew Spero and Amy Miller

EXHIBIT B

Conditions of Approval for Historic Exterior Modification Application (HEMA) No. 2023-03

The Applicant must comply with each and every condition listed below prior to exercising the rights conferred by the Historic Resource Commission's approval and the City of Santa Ana Register of Historic Properties pursuant to Section 30-6 of the Santa Ana Municipal Code. The Applicant must remain in compliance with all conditions listed below:

- The applicant shall install a bronze plaque as per a template on file with the Planning Division honoring and recognizing the structure at 2140 North Ross Street, historically known as the Fuller-Utt House. The plaque shall include the historic name, address, year built, and local historic register designation. The final dimensions, location, text and description on the plaque shall be reviewed and approved by Planning Division staff.
- 2. Prior to final inspection of building permits, the applicant shall complete the following landscape improvements:
 - a. The front yard landscape, including all trees and shrubs, shall be trimmed and thinned so that the building's primary (east) façade and all of its character defining features located on the primary facade (cross-gabled roof of patterned wood shingles with rolled edges; main, recessed entrance; front gable with tripartite window; six-over-one, double-hung sash windows framed with scored cast-stone; and a fixed-pane window with scored cast-stone) are fully visible from the public right-of-way; and
 - b. The applicant shall remove vegetation growth throughout the property (front, sides, and rear yard) so that it is not directly growing on the historic residence and detached garage (including the roof, all facades, and all architectural features of both buildings).
- 3. The applicant shall regularly maintain all landscaping in the front, sides, and rear yards so that the historic building and its character defining features (materials and finishes including stucco, wood, and cast stone; cross-gabled roof of patterned wood shingles with rolled edges; original windows and doors where extant, including the six-over-one, doublehung sash windows framed with scored cast-stone, fixed-pane window with scored cast-stone, and all original double-hung wood sash

windows; chimney; main, recessed entrance; front gable with tripartite window) are visible from the public right-of-way. The vegetative shrub growth shall be maintained and removed as needed so that it does not grow directly on the historic property or detached garage facades in order to ensure longevity of the historic building materials and prevent future damage of said historic materials.