RESOLUTION NO. 2023-05

A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF SANTA ANA APPROVING THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 302 WEST FOURTH STREET (HISTORIC EXTERIOR MODIFICATION APPLICATION NO. 2023-02)

BE IT RESOLVED BY THE HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF SANTA ANA AS FOLLOWS:

Section 1. The Historic Resources Commission of the City of Santa Ana hereby finds, determines and declares as follows:

- A. Mitch Huffman, representing Pintar Investment Company ("Applicant") is requesting approval of Historic Exterior Modification Application No. 2023-02 to allow exterior modifications to the property at 302 West Fourth Street, historically known as the Gilmaker Block.
- B. The legal owners of the property are 4th and Broadway OZ SPE, LLC, a Delaware Limited Liability Company.
- C. The legal description for the subject property is attached hereto as Exhibit A and incorporated by this reference as though fully set forth herein.
- D. The Gilmaker Block (which is one building addressed as 302-308 ½ West Fourth Street and 324 North Broadway) is individually listed as No. 244 on the Santa Ana Register of Historical Properties and categorized as "Key" in 2001. It is also a contributor to the National Register-listed Downtown Santa Ana Historic District.
- E. The Gilmaker Block was originally built in the late 1880s as a brick commercial building; however, in 1920 it was rebuilt using salvaged building materials from the previous building. The Gilmaker Block is architecturally significant as an appropriately rehabilitated example of the brick vernacular commercial style that was prevalent on smaller commercial buildings in towns across the west. Character-defining exterior features of the Gilmaker Block that should be preserved include, but may not be limited to, brick exterior; glazed brick trim; parapet; bay divisions articulated by piers; and architectural ornamentation.
- F. Pursuant to Santa Ana Municipal Code Section 30-6, no exterior physical modifications, other than those identified by the Historic Resources Commission for administrative approval by city staff, shall be permitted with respect to a historic structure until the Historic Resources Commission approves such request at a duly noticed public hearing and issues a certificate of appropriateness. The Historic Resources Commission shall

issue the certificate of appropriateness upon finding that the proposed modification(s) does not substantially change the character and integrity of the historic property.

- G. The proposed interior modifications consist of renovating the existing 8,863square-foot, single-story, commercial structure to accommodate three retail spaces and one restaurant. As part of the new restaurant use, the project will require exterior modifications consisting of a new 4,056-square-foot rooftop addition and 1,632 square-foot rooftop outdoor seating area with trellis.
- H. Pursuant to Santa Ana Municipal Code Section 30-6, the Historic Resources Commission held a duly noticed public hearing on May 3, 2023, for the request for exterior modifications to the Gilmaker Block.
- I. Since the property is deemed a historic structure, all exterior modifications are required to meet the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - 1. The following Secretary of Interior's Standards are applicable:
 - i. The project complies with Standard No. 1. The property currently maintains its historic use as a multi-tenant commercial building. The proposed use will continue multitenant commercial use and will add a new restaurant use to the ground floor and in the new rooftop addition. The new restaurant use will not disturb the historic building, as the interior configuration will remain substantially the same, requiring minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and special relationships. The addition will be setback away from the primary building facades in order to maintain the historic building's overall character.
 - The project complies with Standard No. 2. The historic ii. character of the subject property will be retained and preserved. The proposed rooftop addition and interior alterations have been designed to remove as little historic material as possible. The addition will be smaller in size and massing than the historic building and setback between 15-31 feet from the three street-facing facades so to limit visibility from the public right-of-way. The addition is designed to complement the historic building without overwhelming the existing historic character through its flat roof, rectangular shape, similar yet distinct fenestration, and darker shade of brick laid in a different bond pattern. The majority of building features and materials to be removed or replaced are not historic, including the two large, non-original windows on the east facade, non-original aluminum storefront at the north façade, and some of the rear fenestration.

Although a new door will be added to the east facade to provide access to the electrical room, it will be located towards the rear of building and will not disrupt the building's character defining features (besides a small amount of brick). Changes to the rear (south) façade, including the reuse of existing brick and/or new brick to match parts that require brick infill; the removal of two windows, five infilled windows, two existing window openings, one door with arched transom, and one existing arched infilled door; and the addition of new pedestrian and roll-up metal doors, will not harm the historic character of the property as it is located on a secondary façade that has been altered over time. Most of the building's distinctive character defining features—which are noted as its prominent intersection location in Downtown Santa Ana; flat roof with stepped parapet; brick cladding with ornamentation at the north and east facades; recessed wood-framed storefronts and transoms at the north facade; large window openings and paired wood-framed doors with transoms at the east façade-would not be altered as part of the proposed project. Thus, the historic character of the property would be retained and preserved.

- iii. The project complies with Standard No. 3. The proposed changes will not create a false sense of historical development. The proposed addition will read as contemporary in comparison to the existing brick vernacular commercial style building through its use of slightly differentiated materials, including distinct brick, metal trellis, and aluminum windows. The addition will be compatible yet differentiated from the historic building through its flat roof with parapet, fenestration pattern, and rectangular massing. New roll-up garage doors and single pedestrian door on the east facade, and new doors on the south facade will be compatible with the historic building. Therefore, the architectural treatment will read as contemporary, not conjectural.
- iv. The project complies with Standard No. 5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize the property will be preserved. The project does not propose to remove character-defining features or materials/finishes along the primary facades. Although the east and south facades will undergo some window replacement and a new door opening, and the south façade will also have door replacements and some window removal, the materials and features are either

not historic and/or distinct to the building, or are located on the secondary (rear) façade that has changed over time.

- The Project complies with Standard No. 6. Any deteriorated v. historic features or materials (brick wall cladding; wood windows/doors; decorative glazed and patterned brick detailing at the north and east facades; and three recessed storefront entrances with canted windows, multi-light transoms, and tiled storefront landings at the north façade) identified during the building's rehabilitation will be repaired rather than replaced to the extent feasible. If deteriorated beyond repair, features/materials will be replaced in-kind. The single aluminum-frame storefront addressed as 304 West Fourth Street will be restored to original wood-frame and glazing materials to match the original materials on the adjacent storefronts. The two western-most storefront doors, addressed as 306 and 308 West Fourth Street, will have the wood spacers removed between the doors and transoms, and will be restored to true double doors with a single transom at each storefront.
- vi. The Project meets Standard No. 7. Any chemical or physical treatments required during the building's rehabilitation will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible so as to minimize damage to historic fabric.
- vii. The project complies with Standard No. 9. The new rooftop addition will not destroy historic materials, features, or spatial relationships that characterize the property. The proposed addition will be 16 feet 6 inches from base to parapet and will be set back 31 feet from both the north and east facades (with the exception of a small volume at the southeast corner), which will minimize visibility from the public right-of-way. The addition's scale, volume, massing, and setbacks follow the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for rooftop design while providing a compatible addition with minimal visual impact on the historic building.

The proposed materials of the new addition will be compatible with the existing historic materials, through the use of similar materials, as well as differentiated by a darker shade of brick laid in a different bond pattern and different fenestration patterns that reference the original building's window openings.

The proposed addition will be compatible with National Register-listed Downtown Santa Ana Historic District. The new two-story massing and height will be similar to most surrounding and contributing buildings in the historic district if not smaller in height. The addition's massing, roof, and siding are all compatible with those elements within the historic district.

- viii. The project complies with Standard No. 10. The proposed project is considered generally reversible, as it does not remove essential aspects of the building's form and materials. The proposed addition will be setback 31 feet from the primary north and east facades, and the outdoor seating and trellis area will be setback 15 feet from both north and east facades, where it is not as easily visible from the public right-of-way, and avoids dominating the historic building. The essential form of the historic commercial building and the vast majority of its historic materials will remain unimpaired.
- ix. Standards 4 and 8 are not applicable. No features of this description would be affected by this Project.

<u>Section 2</u>. In accordance with the California Environmental Quality Act, the recommended action is exempt from further review under Section 15303, Class 3 (New Construction of Conversion of Small Structures) and under Section 15331, Class 31 (Historic Resource Restoration/Rehabilitation), as this action is designed in a manner consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards. Categorical Exemption, Environmental Review No. 2022-92 will be filed for this project.

<u>Section 3</u>. The Historic Resources Commission of the City of Santa Ana after conducting the public hearing hereby approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for Historic Exterior Modification Application No. 2023-02, as conditioned in Exhibit B, attached hereto and incorporated herein. The Historic Resources Commission finds that the proposed modifications do not substantially change the character and integrity of the historic property. This decision is based upon the evidence submitted at the above said hearing, which includes, but is not limited to: the Staff Report and exhibits attached thereto and the public testimony, all of which are incorporated herein by this reference.

<u>Section 4</u>. The Historic Resources Commission Secretary is hereby directed to file a certified copy of this Resolution with the County Recorder's Office after the adoption of this Resolution pursuant to Public Resources Code Section 5029.

ADOPTED this 3rd day of May 2023.

Tim Rush Chairperson APPROVED AS TO FORM: Sonia R. Carvalho, City Attorney

Ву:____

John M. Funk Chief Assistant City Attorney

- AYES: Commission members: Alberta Christy, Daniel Cornelius, Ginelle Hardy, Irma Jauregui, Edward Murashie, Mark McLoughlin, Tim Rush (7)
- NOES: Commission members_____
- ABSTAIN: Commission members_____
- NOT PRESENT: Commission members: Keith Carpenter, Dwayne Shipp (2)

CERTIFICATE OF ATTESTATION AND ORIGINALITY

I, NUVIA OCAMPO, Commission Secretary, do hereby attest to and certify the attached Resolution No. 2023-05 to be the original resolution adopted by Historic Resources Commission of the City of Santa Ana on May 3, 2023.

Date: _____

Nuvia Ocampo Commission Secretary City of Santa Ana

EXHIBIT A LEGAL DESCRIPTION

APN	Address	Legal Description	Owner Names
398-591-05	302 West Fourth Street	THE LAND REFERRED TO HEREIN BELOW IS SITUATED IN THE CITY OF SANTA ANA, COUNTY OF ORANGE, STATE OF CALIFORNIA, AND IS DESCRIBED AS FOLLOWS: THAT PORTION OF THE REAL PROPERTY RECORDED DECEMBER 30, 1957, IN BOOK 4150, PAGE 305, OF OFFICIAL RECORDS OF CITY OF SANTA ANA, COUNTY OF ORANGE, STATE OF CALIFORNIA, DESCRIBED FOLLOWS:	4th and Broadway OZ SPE, LLC, a Delaware Limited Liability Company
		BEGINNING AT THE INTERSECTION OF THE SOUTH LINE OF FOURTH STREET WITH THE WEST LINE OF BROADWAY; THENCE WEST ALONG THE SOUTH LINE OF FOURTH STREET, 92.15 FEET; THENCE SOUTH 100 FEET; THENCE EAST 92.15 FEET; THENCE NORTH 100 FEET TO THE POINT OF BEGINNING.	

EXHIBIT B

Conditions of Approval for Historic Exterior Modification Application (HEMA) No. 2023-02

The Applicant must comply with each and every condition listed below prior to exercising the rights conferred by the Historic Resource Commission's approval and the City of Santa Ana Register of Historic Properties pursuant to Section 30-6 of the Santa Ana Municipal Code. The Applicant must remain in compliance with all conditions listed below:

- 1. The applicant shall contract a qualified historic professional to research feasible alternatives to the proposed roll-up garage doors on the primary (east) façade. The historic professional will examine any operable window/door alternatives that are compatible with the existing building's design and maintain the building's historic character. A detailed memorandum produced by the historic professional shall explain the alternatives and address how they meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. Should an alternative exist that is more architecturally compatible with the existing structure, the alternative shall be implemented. If the historic professional concludes that there are no feasible alternatives to the roll-up garage doors, supporting analysis will be included in the memorandum.
- 2. The architect shall work with a qualified historic professional to incorporate additional details in the rooftop addition that reference the historic building. Such ideas that should be explored are adding additional white glazed brick detailing similar to the historic building; adding glass block; and painting exterior finishes red to match the historic building.
- 3. Prior to plan submittal, the applicant shall adjust the architectural plans as follows:
 - a. Based on the memorandum's conclusion regarding the roll-up garage doors, the plans shall reflect the appropriate window/door design for the two windows on the primary (east) façade.
 - b. Remove the vestibule for the electrical room at the primary (east) façade. The door should have a setback of 6-10" from the building face and have an architectural steel door or other barrier installed for security purposes to prevent loitering and trash/debris from accumulating. Additionally, a security light shall be installed above or adjacent to the door.

- c. The painted white brick at the roof top shall not be painted but glazed brick to match the existing brick on the historic building.
- d. The aluminum trellis shall, at a minimum, have a marine/industrial coating (i.e. PPG PXS 700 or similar). Polyvinylidene fluoride PVDF or PVF is preferred. Power coating is optional.
- e. Moveable or permanent shading shall be incorporated at the rooftop trellis.
- 4. The applicant shall research if the proposed rear alley doors can be modified so they are flush with the wall or have a minor setback in order to prevent unintended public usage of the setback space.
- 5. Prior to plan submittal, the historic professional shall update the memorandum with a revised project description and Secretary of the Interior's Standards analysis based on any changes made.
- 6. The applicant shall retain the services of a qualified historic architect, meeting the minimum Professional Qualification Standards in Architecture and/or Historic Architecture as outlined by the National Park Service, to remain on staff for any historic-related project assistance during the duration of the project.
 - a. The qualified historic architect shall conduct minimum monthly site visits and provide construction updates to Planning Division staff during the entire construction period to ensure that the project is executed per the plans and follows the Secretary of the Interior's Standards (SOIS).
 - b. The qualified historic architect shall ensure that the primary (north) façade repairs, primary (east) façade window replacements, and rear (south) facade wall, including all proposed removal and replacement of existing windows and doors, and repair/replacement of original exterior brick, follows the (SOIS).
- 7. Plans to be submitted for Building plan check shall indicate proposed material for the rear (south) facade doors.
- 8. The applicant shall contact the Planning Division to request a rough final inspection at which point the project is approximately 80 percent complete so as to ensure that any construction that has taken place at such point is in conformance to the approved plans and to the satisfaction of the Planning Division. The applicant shall then contact the Planning Division to request a final inspection prior to any building permit finals.

FREE RECORDING PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE § 27383

9. The applicant shall install a bronze plaque as per a template on file with the Planning Division honoring and recognizing the structure at 302 West Fourth Street, historically known as the Gilmaker Block. The plaque shall include the historic name, address, year built, and local historic register designation. The final dimensions, location, text and description on the plaque shall be reviewed and approved by Planning Division staff.